

**Empowering a New Generation of Integrity Champions in Afghanistan, to build a just and equitable world where citizens act with and demand Integrity.**

**Afghanistan - Learning Paper - 2016-2017**

Ellen Goldberg





## Contents

Abbreviations.....	2
Objectives and Methodology .....	3
<b>Executive Summary</b> .....	3
Results and Activities.....	5
To what extent were learners fully engaged and satisfied with the trainings? .....	5
To what extent were learners well-versed and applying their monitoring training? .....	6
To what extent was the mentoring useful to IWA and the mentees? .....	7
Potential areas for future collaboration – raised in the 2015 Afghanistan Learning Paper .....	8
Notable Achievements.....	9
Lessons Learned – The Enabling Environment .....	9
Conclusions.....	10

## Abbreviations

Community Based Monitoring	CBM
Community Integrity Building	CIB
Integrity Action	IA
Integrity Champion	IC
Integrity Watch Afghanistan	IWA
Provincial Integrity Network	PIN
Rebuild Consultants	RC
Training of Trainers	ToT



## Objectives and Methodology

### Main Objective of the Project:

**Empowering a New Generation of Integrity Champions in Afghanistan, to build a just and equitable world where citizens act with and demand integrity.**

Integrity Action (IA) has prepared this learning paper with the aim of identifying the factors that provide an enabling environment for the development of a cadre of Integrity Champions (ICs) throughout Afghanistan. Therefore the emphasis will be on how citizens became active, learning how to implement the Community Based Monitoring (CBM) approach, a derivative of Community Integrity Building (CIB) developed by IA. This 2016 learning paper will assess and analyse:

- 1) to what extent were learners fully engaged and satisfied with the monitoring training,
- 2) to what extent were learners well-versed and applying their monitoring training, and
- 3) to what extent the mentoring was useful to Integrity Watch Afghanistan (IWA) and the mentees.

The author was commissioned to act as an Integrity Advisor to IWA for two years. This paper was based on a 10-day visit to Afghanistan in late January 2017, the end of the first year. Due to the security situation, we had a limited number of external meetings, besides the Integrity Advisor's full attendance (with partial translation) at the 6-day training.

Background regarding IA's work with IWA can be found in the Afghanistan Learning Paper – 2015, by Joy Saunders: <http://integrityaction.org/publication/afghanistan-learning-paper-%E2%80%93-2015-closing-loop-and-combining-community-integrity>.

### Executive Summary

IA has been working in 2016/2017 with IWA to develop a cadre of ICs<sup>1</sup> throughout Afghanistan. This was carried out by joint preparation and collaboration through which IA supplied an 'Integrity Advisor', Ms Ellen Goldberg (Head of Integrity Education and author of this Learning Paper), who worked together with senior IWA staff. The advisor assisted with the trainings and workshops, developing materials and then translating them into Dari and Pashto, and mentoring Provincial Coordinators and Assistants. Mr Khan Zaman Amarkhail and Mr Ahmad Bilal Popalzai were senior IWA managers who were invaluable in jointly managing the work needed within IWA throughout Year 1, with special thanks to Mr Popalzai for his comments on the Year 1 and Year 2 plans.

The 1<sup>st</sup> Generation of ICs was selected based on set criteria<sup>2</sup> from 8 provinces: Kabul, Herat, Nangarhar, Balkh, Kunduz, Paktia, Bamian and Kapisa. IA commissioned an

---

<sup>1</sup> 'Integrity Champions' is a motivational name that inspires the monitors.

<sup>2</sup> For example: honesty, literacy (not always necessary), well-respected in the community, supports community monitoring, not a staff member, lives close to projects to be monitored and has time, social work (not always necessary), willing to volunteer;



outsourced firm 'Rebuild Consultants'<sup>3</sup>, to prepare upgraded training materials to be used in the ICs' trainings. However, before training the ICs, Rebuild Consultants delivered a Training of Trainers (ToT) to IWA training staff from 10<sup>th</sup> to 15<sup>th</sup> April 2016, so they could help support the subsequent trainings.

The plan was to train the IWA trainers, who would assist the consultants to train the 1<sup>st</sup> Generation of ICs on the monitoring, and who subsequently were to train the 2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs back in their home provinces.

About a month after the ToT, the "Camp 1" training was conducted from 17<sup>th</sup> to 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2016, in which 40 ICs attended, five from each of the eight provinces. There were 29 males (72.5%) and 11 females (27.5%) participating. The feedback was extremely positive on both of the trainings, with full attendance, engagement and skills acquisition, despite a few logistical and administrative problems<sup>4</sup>.

Trainers worked with the 1<sup>st</sup> Generation of ICs in the May 2016 training. After returning home, the ICs each monitored one project. Therefore, 40 projects were monitored, resulting in a Fix-Rate<sup>5</sup> of 73.83%.

The "Camp 2" training, which was originally scheduled for December 2016, was rescheduled to late January 2017, due to clashes with the universities' calendars. Lessons learned from the Camp 1 training contributed to improvements that were subsequently incorporated into the agenda for the Camp 2 training.

As part of the original work plan, 100% of the 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs were to participate in the Camp 2 training - which was a refresher – and they all attended.

Note that following Camp 1, a decision was made to add one more province – Parwan – so that the 6<sup>th</sup> province brought the attendance for Camp 2 to a total of 48 ICs. Camp 2 began with a review of the former material, and some new integrity education content, as preparation for the 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs to serve as trainers for the 2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs in 2017.

All first year goals were reached, and surpassed the goal of 40 projects monitored. After all three trainings, the initial 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs subsequently trained the 2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs, honing their skills back in their communities, all according to plan.

There were at least 30% women and youth – although more youth than women. To encourage recruitment of women monitors, the Integrity Advisor included a Gender Equality and Social Inclusion exercise during the Camp 2 training, and held a discussion with 8 of the female ICs and staff, as the basis for energised recruitment of women ICs.

---

<sup>3</sup> Rebuild Consultants is an Afghan registered company with more than 45 years of cross-cultural experience in the Afghan context. [www.rebuildconsultants.com](http://www.rebuildconsultants.com)

<sup>4</sup> For example: late translation of project manual and late dissemination; erratic mentoring schedule at start;

<sup>5</sup> A Fix-Rate is the percentage of solved problems out of the total valid problems identified.

Thus far, Camp 1 produced 40 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs; then trained 48 2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs in each of the 8 provinces for 384 ICs; and an additional province was added with 51 ICs, for a grand total of 483 trained ICs working in 9 provinces (see Table). They continue to monitor, learn and promote a culture of transparency, accountability and integrity, supported by their Provincial Coordinators and Assistants.

Activity	Date	Participants	Total
Training of Trainers	10-15 April 2016		
Camp 1	17-23 May 2016	40 original ICs	40
Additional Province	After Camp 1	8 new ICs from 9th province	8
Camp 2	21-25 January 2017	48 ICs (same attendees from Camp 1)	48
Training in Provinces	26 January 2017 onward	48 2 <sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs * 8 provinces	384
Additional ICs	After Camp 2	51 2 <sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs	51
		<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>483</b>

Mentoring support was provided by the Integrity Advisor to 6 IWA Provincial Coordinators and Assistants over a 6-month period. Feedback was solicited from the mentees, to assist the Integrity Advisor in improving the mentoring process. Training materials have been upgraded, other existing materials have been translated into Dari and Pashto, and new materials have been prepared and are in use.

After strengthening the integrity education aspects of the trainings in 2016, we are now sharing new ideas and approaches using expertise of the senior management of both IWA and IA.

### Results and Activities

#### To what extent were learners fully engaged and satisfied with the trainings?

The annual work plan included three different trainings CBM. First was the *ToT*, then the *1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs Training (called 'Camp 1')*, and 8 months later, the *'Camp 2' Training*.

IA commissioned a local Afghan firm 'Rebuild Consultants' (RC), to prepare and deliver a 6-day ToT, which was held from 10th to 15th April 2016. Their materials were excellent, as were their training methods. Their trainings are more interactive than the style of some of the IWA trainers, but IA and senior IWA trainers are working on expanding the Afghan staff's skills and training tools. Many of the trainers returned home to review the manual and implement some of its activities with their aspiring ICs.

There were a few initial problems that needed attention during the training. For example, some attendance was erratic due to trainers running to their offices periodically for a meeting. The trainers discussed how disruptive and



counterproductive it is to miss parts of the training, and the trainers understood that, after which there was much better energy and engagement from all the participants. Everyone received the toolkits, however some were received late. Some terminology was difficult for the participants to understand. This is a common phenomenon in IA's experience in all the countries in which we work, and we find this true with other organisations running similar types of programmes. For example, where no direct translation exists in Dari and Pashto for the words 'accountability' and 'integrity', it was quite important to assist participants to understand the terms, and this was done by *connecting their activities with the terms and vice versa*. Although this was a very intensive training, the mix of trainers kept the participants engaged. Some trainers were still using mainly frontal lecturing, while a few others were beginning to use their limited repertoire of interactive exercises, games, and role plays that they had recently learned.

The ToTs workshop in April was followed by a training for ICs from 17<sup>th</sup> to 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2016. There was a great improvement in the skills of the trainers, who were now using different styles of training and interactive activities, which held the attention and engagement of the ICs. Main topics presented included an introduction to Integrity, CBM, what it means to be an IC, The Monitoring Process and Skills, Constructive Engagement to Resolve Problems, Monitoring Tools, and Sector-Specific Training (Schools, Trials, Infrastructure). At the end of each day, final sessions were held specifically for open discussion. Participants talked with trainers and one another about remaining questions they had that were related to what they had learned each day. On the final day, the last sessions were an opportunity - in a relaxed environment - to think and discuss more deeply how best to train their aspiring ICs.

#### [To what extent were learners well-versed and applying their monitoring training?](#)

As mentioned above, after their first training, ICs returned home and each monitored a project, which resulted in a high Fix-Rate. So they were quite successful in applying their training after one workshop. The results after Camp 2 will be analysed at the end of the project, in December 2017.

During Camp 2, the Integrity Advisor met with 8 of the women monitors, who were of various ages. They were very involved in their CBM – mostly carried out by pairs of women - not including their Maharam/female chaperone, usually a member of the family – and had strong convictions regarding gender equality and gender equity. The women spoke quite openly, stating their main motivation: 'Women are part of society – half the population – and we demand equality.' These female ICs were working to reduce corruption through CBM, in trials and infrastructure, while others were monitoring schools. All of them wanted to recruit more women to become ICs. The extra budget for the chaperones was not taken into account, so this is a need to keep in mind for future trainings.

Trained IC-supported educators are working on influencing government, private sector and communities on pro-poor and gender-sensitive policies, but this is quite difficult for the ICs. There are numerous sensitivities relating to promoting gender equality

and gender equity in Afghanistan, and initial advocacy attempts by 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs to improve government gender policies were unsuccessful. Nonetheless, it is recognised that policy advocacy and subsequent change are usually relatively slow processes. With additional training on gender advocacy in Year 2, we hope that the monitors may have a better chance for policy change.

Back in their provinces, the ICs were anxious to get involved in the PINs: Provincial Integrity Networks, in 7 provinces. These are networks of stakeholders from various sectors who work together against corruption, provide training for the PINs on various integrity issues. Government officials and local councils get involved in formulating solutions for problems brought for discussion with other stakeholders. Sometimes CEOs and other experts come to speak to the group, journalists were sometimes involved, and of course representatives of civil society, such as Provincial Coordinators and ICs.

In the meantime, some ICs who were members of a PIN, have contributed to campaigns for more engagement of women in Parents' Councils, particularly in Bamian Province. Others have also been involved in campaigning against violence towards women in Herat, Kapisa and Kunduz provinces, through the PINs.

As time went on, the ICs were better understanding the connection between integrity in everyday activities (such as monitoring public projects), and how promoting good governance and integrity through knowledge sharing could lead them to get involved in public activities such as advocacy for accountability and transparency. As the ICs continued their involvement in monitoring, they were able to resolve problems in schools, trials and infrastructure projects, often assisted by local community members. The awareness raising on the community level has strengthened their understanding of social accountability and of community monitoring of development projects, accompanied by some training on the Access to Information Law. With the PINs, community members and local government officials also began to realise the significance of constructive dialogue with each other. This has resulted in a more consultative approach in problem-solving, as well as in project implementation, and proactively promoting accountability and transparency.

At the end of Camp 2, some of the participants performed a role play of a court case for the group. It demonstrated how the monitoring works, and how solutions to problems are resolved.

IWA took the opportunity to share the ICs' activities through its social media site, and in newsletters and a magazine. They distributed an article on the Camp 1 training, which led to a distribution of 2,890 copies, alongside soft copies on [www.iwaweb.org](http://www.iwaweb.org). Following this, 11 success stories were shared by ICs active across the 8 provinces.

#### [To what extent was the mentoring useful to IWA and the mentees?](#)

The Integrity Advisor's mentoring process started in July 2016, with six mentees, through mid-December. The first step was to speak with each mentee individually, introducing the mentor's background, and then asking the mentees to describe



themselves and their background, as well as what they would like to get out of the mentoring process. These steps helped to develop trust and to prepare for each mentee's specific challenges and needs.

The intent is to provide the mentees with new knowledge and new perspectives that will help them improve their performance as trainers and leaders in their provinces. The mentees are well educated, and also serve as supervisors of the ICs, who need follow-up and monitoring enhancement for the wide variety of problems that are identified and needing solutions. The main feedback received thus far from the mentees is that they are acquiring new skills to solve problems through better communication, negotiations and other techniques, and they are also improving their English.

Lessons learned are shared with the different mentees. The Provincial Coordinators and Assistants share their learning with their IC monitors, which is strongly encouraged. The Camp 2 training included some reviewing and sharing of the learning with all participants. They, in turn, are incorporating the learning into their daily monitoring activities.

*Following is the section of IWA's report to the EU that dealt with the work of the Integrity Advisor:*

"Integrity Action is the affiliated entity for Integrity Watch. The relationship throughout has been supportive and cooperative. The role of Integrity Action's Integrity Advisor Ms. Ellen Goldberg as an advisor and mentor to ICs has been valuable. The Integrity Building Team had regular interaction with Ellen through Skype and emails discussing challenges concerning ICs' activities. She had also interactions with Provincial Coordinators and Program Assistants of Integrity Watch in the provinces. Ellen was engaged with 6 mentees whom she was giving advice and mentoring support on solutions to problems and various approaches of dealing with communities. The provincial staff has always regarded her support pretty helpful.

Furthermore, Ellen was supportive in terms of reviewing the training material and providing her inputs for up gradation and meeting the standards. We are glad that she will be attending the Camp 2 Training in Kabul which is expected to be held from 21<sup>st</sup> to 25<sup>th</sup> January 2017 and ICs Conference on 26<sup>th</sup> January 2017."

Above quote was submitted to the EU (the funder) by Mr Ahmad Bilal Popalzai.

[Potential areas for future collaboration – raised in the 2015 Afghanistan Learning Paper](#)

**Public and private sector training** – Suggested areas not yet explored between IA and IWA are public sector or private sector trainings, although IWA has begun discussions with public and private sector entities. As the integrity education programme is further developed as part of the CBM, it is likely that focused effort will be needed in these two sectors to make a meaningful contribution to integrity.



**Maintenance of projects** - One area discussed is that of re-visiting projects already monitored to see how they are currently performing and reviewing maintenance of infrastructure projects. If problems were found, the idea would be to constructively engage until they were resolved. If IWA could do this alongside a cost-benefit analysis of investing in maintenance, this would form an excellent evidence base of the value of CBM, with a further potential of creating new jobs and livelihoods within Afghanistan in a post-aid era as the government realises the need to invest in maintenance contracts to maintain infrastructure and services.

### Notable Achievements

48 trained 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs from 9 provinces

40 projects monitored (schools, infrastructure, trials), with a Fix-Rate of 73.83%

Total of 483 trained 1<sup>st</sup> Generation and 2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs, now monitoring with CBM

Production of Trainers' Manual and Workbook

ICs are getting involved in PINs (Provincial Integrity Networks) for promoting good governance, integrity, knowledge sharing and advocacy for accountability and transparency

Citizens' awareness has been raised on social accountability and monitoring, while government institutions have recognised the significance of constructive dialogue with communities, resulting in a consultative approach to monitoring and solving problems

IWA distributed an article on the Camp 1 training, which led to a distribution of 2,890 copies, alongside soft copies on [www.iwaweb.org](http://www.iwaweb.org)

Close working relationship between Integrity Action and IWA staff

### Lessons Learned – The Enabling Environment

These points demonstrate how initial problems, if handled well, can be fixed.

Conducting trainings in one's own office building often causes a distraction with staff running in and out for phone calls or meetings. A clear discussion on the importance of being completely present for the training, resulted in all participants being fully engaged for the entire 5 days.

Trainers who have a very limited (or no) repertoire of interactive methods of training, need to discuss why interaction, exercises, games, role plays, etc are productive methods, and not just 'wasting time having fun'. To quote Confucius: "I hear and I forget. I see and I remember. I do and I understand."

Terminology is sometimes difficult to understand – especially when a local language does not have a direct translation of a term - so participants must be assisted in working with live examples or activities that clearly demonstrate the new term.



Recruitment of more female ICs is critical, not only for personal equality and equal opportunity, but also to be able to reach those Afghan women who lack access to information about their rights. The female ICs who attended Camp 1 and Camp 2, returned home determined to further develop their involvement in social accountability and to engage their communities.

Budget must be set aside for Maharams (chaperones from a woman's family) if needed, in order to mainstream women as monitors, and pay attention to gender issues and needs.

It is important, either at the end of each day, or at the beginning of each day, to review concepts and answer questions.

Lack of support at the level of 'lower' government departments can be corrected through a mutual consultative approach at higher levels [e.g., Ministry of Education (for schools), Supreme Court (for trials), Ministry of Economy (for infrastructure), etc].

Advocacy must be well planned, with persuasive communication and negotiation skills, and sufficient time for bureaucratic discussion. Do not give up.

Local partners look to IA for consultations, mentoring, provision of capacity building activities, materials development, and assistance with the process of formulating solutions to monitoring problems.

Logistical problems:

Time for translation, editing and publication of materials must be taken into account

Mentoring needs to be steady; frequent schedule-changing hinders the process of capacity building

Costs for Maharams (female chaperones) must be taken into account in the budget.

### Conclusions

The three trainings held in April (ToT), May (1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs) 2016, and January 2017 (2<sup>nd</sup> Generation ICs) were highly successful, as demonstrated by the full attendance and active participation of Trainers, 1<sup>st</sup> Generation ICs in Camp 1, and with 100% attendance of the same ICs in Camp 2. The Integrity Advisor attended Camp 2, for 5 full days, spoke with male and female participants and never had seen such an audience of respectful listeners (clapping after each speaker, whether trainer or IC) and knowledgeable about their monitoring and awareness raising tasks. All participants individually and actively shared their successes and their failures with one another, and received constructive advice from their colleagues. The Camp 2 training was a very intense 5 days, but the ICs were active listeners, offering suggestions and totally involved. At the end of Camp 2, participants performed a role play of one of their court cases, and how it was resolved with integrity. It was also a great accomplishment that the first group of 40 monitored projects achieved a Fix-Rate over 73%, when the usual average for IA's Fix-Rates is just over 50%. It is clear that those who were



trained as trainers, and those ICs who participated in the Camps, were successfully trained for local monitoring.

The mentoring programme also went well, with mentees bringing the Advisor monitoring problems to discuss, to learn some new personal skills (communication, supervising, negotiations, etc), or to enhance some of the work on the ground. It is fulfilling its purpose, to introduce the mentees to new ideas and challenges.

IWA and IA work well together. IA is pleased to be in a position to help build capacity and be part of creating positive change in Afghanistan. The joint discussions with IWA's leadership and staff contribute to moving the work forward, whether it is advocacy for new policies or opening multistakeholder trainings. As difficult as the Afghan environment is – limited movement, safety issues, kidnappings, etc – IWA and IA were able to create an enabling environment that supported the ICs, and allowed them to go back to their provinces with stronger skills and energy to push for change for better lives in Afghanistan.